January 14, 2019

David Bernhardt Acting Secretary U.S. Department of the Interior 1849 C St. NW Washington, D.C. 20240

## Re: Request for Extension of Public Comment Period on Interior Department's Proposed Revisions to Freedom of Information Act Regulations, Docket No. DOI-2018-0017, Request for Public Hearings

Dear Acting Secretary Bernhardt:

On December 28, 2018, the U.S. Department of the Interior proposed significant, expansive, and novel revisions to its Freedom of Information Act regulations that appear to undermine government transparency, defy the Freedom of Information Act, and erode the public's trust in the Department. *See* 83 Fed. Reg. 67,175 (Dec. 28, 2018). Worse, the proposed revisions have come amid a government shutdown, the holiday season, and a time of immense transition within the Interior Department with Secretary Zinke's departure.

## In light of these considerations, we request that Interior provide at least 120 days for the public to submit comments, with the 120-day comment period beginning when the government shutdown is resolved.<sup>1</sup> We further request that the Interior Department hold public hearings regarding its proposed rule changes.

An extension of the public comment period and public hearings are imminently justified. In light of the government shutdown, which began on December 21, 2018, there are currently no Interior Department staff available to receive and review public comments. Furthermore, there is no certainty that public comment can even be submitted. Although Interior has directed the public to submit comments via the website, regulations.gov, that site indicates that "continued systems operations cannot be guaranteed." *See <u>https://www.regulations.gov/</u> (accessed Jan. 2, 2019). Although the public can mail comments, we have grave concern that Interior is likely to misplace mailed comments that are stockpiled during the shutdown.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> At a minimum, we request the Department of Interior provide an additional 60 days for the public to comment on this complex rulemaking, which has the potential for limiting and adversely impacting important public rights under FOIA. Under similar circumstances, the Department of Interior has generally provided at least its "usual 60 days" for comments, and regularly grants requests for an extension time for comments. *See e.g., Application and Permit Information Requirements; Permit Eligibility; Definitions of Ownership and Control; the Applicant/Violator System; Alternative Enforcement Actions*, 63 Fed. Reg. 70,580 (Mar. 21, 1998) (providing the "usual 60 days"). Indeed, in its 2016 revision of the FOIA regulations, the Department provided 60 days for comment. *Freedom of Information Act Regulations*, 81 Fed. Reg. 11,124 (Mar. 3 2016); *see also Resource Management Planning*, 81 FR 89580-01 (Dec. 12, 2016) (90 day formal comment period); *Waste Prevention, Production Subject to Royalties, and Resource Conservation; Rescission or Revision of Certain Requirements*, 83 Fed. Reg. 49,184 (Sept. 28, 2018) (60 days).

Additionally, given the shutdown, the public currently has no opportunity to gain a more robust understanding of Interior's proposal in order to provide informed and meaningful comments. There are no Interior staff currently available to answer questions regarding the proposed revisions. Although the proposal indicates that the public can contact Ms. Cindy Carfaro with the Office of Executive Secretariat for further information, Ms. Carfaro is not currently available due to the shutdown. What's more, although organizations have submitted Freedom of Information Act requests to obtain more background records regarding the proposed revisions, the Interior Department is not currently accepting Freedom of Information Act requests.

Finally, given the nature of Interior's proposed revisions, an extension and an opportunity to engage in public hearings is fully warranted. Interior is proposing revisions to its Freedom of Information Act regulations that appear to stretch beyond what any other federal agency has ever adopted or proposed in direct circumvention of the Act's purpose. Interior is proposing revisions that would allow it to deny Freedom of Information Act requests that may require what it calls "unreasonably burdensome" searches, to more easily deny fee waiver requests, and to delay providing responsive records. Such revisions are without precedent and diverge significantly from the Department's current regulations and the Freedom of Information Act itself.

Given the circumstances and the gravity of Interior's unprecedented proposed rule changes, an extension of the public comment period and public hearings is warranted.

We request the Department of the Interior acknowledge receipt of this letter as soon as possible and provide a written response to our requests. Thank you in advance for considering this request.

Sincerely,

Jeremy Nichols Climate and Energy Program Director WildEarth Guardians 2590 Walnut St. Denver, CO 80205 (303) 437-7663 inichols@wildearthguardians.org

Joshua Smith Senior Staff Attorney Sierra Club Environmental Law Program 2101 Webster St., Suite 1300 Oakland, CA 94612 (415) 977-5560 joshua.smith@sierraclub.org Margaret E. Townsend Open Government Staff Attorney Center for Biological Diversity 225 N. Killingsworth St. Portland, OR 97217 (971) 717-6409 mtownsend@biologicaldiversity.org

Adam Carlesco Staff Attorney, Climate and Energy Food and Water Watch 1616 P St. NW, Suite 310 Washington, D.C. 20036 (202) 683-4925 acarlesco@fwwatch.org Alison Flint Litigation Manager and Senior Policy Analyst The Wilderness Society 1660 Wynkoop, Suite 850 Denver, CO 80202 (303) 802-1404 <u>alison\_flint@tws.org</u>

Yvonne Chi Attorney Earthjustice 633 17<sup>th</sup> St., Suite 1600 Denver, CO 80205 (503) 295-0490 ychi@earthjustice.org

Nicole Ghio Senior Fossil Fuels Program Manager Friends of the Earth US 2150 Allston Way Berkeley, CA 94704 (510) 900-8064 nghio@foe.org

Yogin Kothari Senior Manager of Government Affairs Union of Concerned Scientists 1825 K Street NW Washington, D.C. 20006 Ykothari@ucsusa.org

Kym Hunter Senior Attorney Southern Environmental Law Center 601 West Rosemary Street Chapel Hill, NC 27516 (919) 967-1450 khunter@selenc.org Wendy Jacobs Emmett Clinical Professor of Environmental Law Harvard Law School Emmett Environmental Law and Policy Clinic Harvard Law School, WCC Suite 4119 (617) 496-3368 wjacobs@law.harvard.edu

Nina Bell Executive Director Northwest Environmental Advocates P.O. Box 12187 Portland, OR 97212 (503) 295-0490 nbell@advocates-nwea.org

Kevin Hugh Bell Staff Counsel Public Employees for Environmental Responsibility 962 Wayne Ave. Silver Spring, MD 20910 (240) 247-0298 kbell@peer.org

Natalie Levine Program Manager, Park Resource Protection National Parks Conservation Association 777 6th St NW, Suite 700 Washington, DC 20001 (202) 660-2059 nlevine@npca.org

Dana Johnson Staff Attorney Wilderness Watch P.O. Box 9623 Moscow, ID 83843 (208) 310-7003 danajohnson@wildernesswatch.org Sarah Lamdan & Rebecca Bratspies Professors Center for Urban and Environmental Reform (CUER) CUNY School of Law sarah.lamdan@law.cuny.edu

Lori Andresen President Save Our Sky Blue Waters PO Box 3661 Duluth, MN 55803 (218) 340-2451 andres01@charter.net

Gary Macfarlane Ecosystem Defense Director Friends of the Clearwater PO Box 9241 Moscow, ID 83843 (208) 882-9755 gary@friendsoftheclearwater.org

Zygmunt Plater Prof. Of Law Boston College Law School ( for ID only) 885 Centre St. Newton centre MA 02459 (617) 552-4387 Plater@bc.edu

Matt Sandler Staff Attorney Rocky Mountain Wild 1536 Wynkoop, Suite 900 Denver, CO 80202 (303) 579-5162 matt@rockymountainwild.org

Sara Colangelo Director of the Environmental Law & Policy Program; Visiting Professor of Law Georgetown University Law Center 600 New Jersey Ave, NW Washington DC 20001 (202) 661-6543 sac54@law.georgetown.edu Mark Salvo Vice President, Landscape Conservation Defenders of Wildlife 1130 17th Street NW Washington DC 20036 <u>msalvo@defenders.org</u>

Mike Garrity Executive Director Alliance for the Wild Rockies P.O. Box 505 Helena, MT 59624 (406) 459-5936 Wildrockies@gmail.com

Sam Kalen Professor of Law University of Wyoming College of Law (Affiliation Purposes Only) Laramie, Wyoming 82071 skalen@uwyo.edu

Keith Hammer Chair Swan View Coalition 3165 Foothill Road Kalispell, MT 59901 keith@swanview.org

Kelly Nokes Staff Attorney Western Environmental Law Center 208 Paseo del Pueblo Sur, No. 602 Taos, NM 87571 (575) 6138051 nokes@westernlaw.org

Victoria Clark Executive Director Trustees for Alaska 1026 W 4<sup>th</sup> Ave., Suite 201 Anchorage, AK 99501 (907) 433-2010 vclark@trustees.org Linda Krop Chief Counsel Environmental Defense Center 906 Garden St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101 (805) 963-1622 Ikrop@environmentaldefensecenter.org

Shelley Silbert Executive Director Great Old Broads for Wilderness Box 2924 (970) 385-9577 <u>Shelley@greatoldbroads.org</u>

Leslie W Glustrom Board Member Clean Energy Action 4492 Burr Place Boulder, CO 80303 <u>lglustrom@gmail.com</u>

Michael J. Painter Coordinator Californians for Western Wilderness P.O. Box 210474 San Francisco, CA. 94121 (415) 752-3911 mike@caluwild.org

Brodia Minter Public Lands Advocate Klamath Siskiyou Wildlands Center PO BOX 102 Ashland Oregon 97520 (541) 488-5789 Brodia@kswild.org

Gina B. Hardin President 350 Colorado 3330 W 31st Ave Denver, CO 80211 (303) 525-3076 ginahardin@msn.com Erik Molvar Executive Director Western Watersheds Project 319 S. 6<sup>th</sup> St. Laramie, WY 82070 (307) 399-7910 emolvar@westernwatersheds.org

Carson Barylak Campaigns Manager International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW) 1600 14th St., NW, Ste. 510 Washington, D.C. 20036 (614) 266-9475 cbarylak@ifaw.org

Steph Tai Professor University of Wisconsin Law School 975 Bascom Mall Madison, WI 53706 tai2@wisc.edu

Bob Shavelson Cook Inletkeeper 3734 Ben Walters Lane Homer, AK 99603 (907) 235-4068 bob@inletkeeper.org

Jeff Kuyper Executive Director Los Padres ForestWatch PO Box 831 Santa Barbara, CA 93102 (805) 617-4610 info@lpfw.org

Daniel E. Estrin General Counsel Waterkeeper Alliance, Inc. 180 Maiden Lane, Suite 603 New York, NY 10038 (212) 747-0622 x132 destrin@waterkeeper.org Stephen Bloch Legal Director Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance 425 East 100 South Salt Lake City, Utah 84111 (801) 486-3161 steve@suwa.org

Johanna Hamburger Wildlife Attorney Animal Welfare Institute 900 Pennsylvania Ave, SE Washington, DC 20003 johanna@awionline.org

Natasha Leger Executive Director Citizens for a Healthy Community PO Box 1283 Paonia, CO 81428 (970) 399-9700 natasha@chc4you.org

Denise Boggs Director Conservation Congress Billings, MT Denise@conservationcongress-ca.org

Shaleas Harrison Public Lank Policy Specialist Wyoming Wilderness Association 44 S. Main Street Sheridan, WY 82801 (307) 272-7136 shaleas@wildwyo.org

Troy Redding Community Organizer Western Colorado Alliance 134 N 6th St. Grand Junction, CO 81501 (970) 812 2111 troy@westerncoloradoalliance.org Katharine K DuVivier Professor University of Denver 2255 East Evans Avenue Denver, CO 80208 (303) 871-6281 kkduvivier@law.du.edu

Dana Bove Vice President Front Range Nesting Bald Eagle Studies 1935 Tincup Court Boulder, CO 80305 (303) 862-5524 erintoes@comcast.net

Annecoos Wiersema Professor of Law University of Denver Sturm College of Law 2255 E Evans Avenue Denver, CO 80208 awiersema@law.du.edu

Kevin Emmerich Co- Founder Basin and Range Watch Box 70 Beatty, Nevada, 89003 (775) 553-2806 atomicquailranch@gmail.com

Larry Campbell Conservation Director Friends of the Bitterroot PO Box, 442 Hamilton, MT 59840 (406) 821-3110 Icampbell@bitterroot.net

Jennifer Best Assistant Legal Director Friends of Animals 7500 E Arapahoe Rd., Ste. 385 Centennial, CO (720) 949-7790 Jennifer@friendsofanimals.org Irma Russell Professor University of Missouri-Kansas City 500 E. 52nd Street Kansas City, MO 64110 (406) 493-2139 russelli@umkc.edu

Margaret Bowman Assistant Professor University of Tulsa 4th Place Tulsa, OK 74104 (918) 631-2450 wmb1339@utulsa.edu

Ben Levitan Attorney Environmental Defense Fund 1875 Connecticut Ave., N.W. Suite 600 Washington, DC 20009 (202) 572-3318 blevitan@edf.org

Alejandro Camacho Professor of Law and Director, Center for Land, Environment, and Natural Resources University of California, Irvine School of Law 401 East Peltason Drive, Law 4500-A Irvine, CA 92697-8000 (949) 824 4160 acamacho@law.uci.edu

Patrick Llewellyn Attorney Public Citizen 1600 20th Street NW Washington, DC 20009 pllewellyn@citizen.org Joel A. Mintz Professor Emeritus and C. William Trout Senior Fellow Nova Southeastern University College of Law 3305 College Avenue Davie, FL 33314 (954) 262-6160 mintzj@nova.edu

Cyndi Tuell Tuell Consulting 903 N. Alder Tucson, AZ 85705 cyndi@tuellconsulting.com

Julia Page Acting Oil & Gas Team Chair Idaho Organization of Resource Councils 910 W. Main Street Boise, ID 83702 (208) 991-4451 dpaddock@IORCinfo.org

Peter Hart Staff Attorney Wilderness Workshop Box 1442 Carbondale, CO 81623 (970) 963-3977 peter@wildernessworkshop.org

Patrice McDermott Director Government Information Watch 1103 Fairview Court Silver Spring, MD 20910 pmcdermott@govinfowatch.net Sara Kendall Program Director Western Organization of Resource Councils 220 South 27<sup>th</sup> St. Billings, MT 59101 (202) 680-3538 sara@worc.org

Ted Boettner Executive Director WV Center on Budget and Policy 8 Capitol Street Charleston, WV 25301 (304) 720-8682 tboettner@wvpolicy.org

David Sligh Conservation Director Wild Virginia 1433 Wickham Pond Drive Charlottesville, VA 22902 (434) 964-7455 david@wildvirginia.org

Irene Leech President Virginia Citizens Consumer Council 4220 North Fork Rd Elliston, VA 24087 <u>vaconsumeradvocate@gmail.com</u> Barbara Adams Richmond Interfaith Climate Justice 5100 Montebello Circle Richmond, VA 23231 <u>barb5100@comcast.net</u> (804) 484-2773

Larry V Thomas President West Virginia Highlands Conservancy P. O. Box 306 Charleston, WV 25321 (304) 567-2602 larryvthomas@aol.com Vivian Stockman Interim Executive Director Ohio Valley Environmental Council PO Box 6753 Huntington, WV 25773 (304) 522-0246 vivian@ohvec.org

Lore Rosenthal Program Coordinator Greenbelt Climate Action Network 2-R Gardenway Greenbelt, MD 20770 (301) 345-2234 simplicitygroupsmd@gmail.com

Rebecca Roter Chairperson Breathe Easy Susquehanna County PO Box 98 Montrose PA 18801 (267) 733-5211 <u>Aludra@aol.com</u>

Jim Anderson President Peace Action New York State 64 Fulton St Manhattan, NY 10038 <u>Peaceactionjim@gmail.com</u> Georgina Shanley

Co-Founder Citizens United for Renewable Energy Ocean City, NJ <u>Georginashanley@gmail.com</u>

Eric Engle Chairman Mid-Ohio Valley Climate Action 3850 Central Avenue Apt. 4 Parkersburg, WV 26104 (304) 488-4384 ericengle85@yahoo.com Aaron Mintzes Senior Policy Counsel Earthworks 1612 K Street, N.W. Suite 904 Washington, DC 20006 amintzes@earthworks.org

Andrea Miller Executive Director People Demanding Action 18459 Patriot Ln. Ruther Glen, VA 22546 (443) 878-2071 andrea@peopledemandingaction.org

Freemanhobs Allan Veteran's Service Corps 1394 Blair Park Road Crozet, VA 22932 (434) 409-8666 FreemanHobs@gmail.com

John Weisheit Conservation Director Living Rivers & Colorado Riverkeeeper PO Box 466 Moab, UT 84532 (435) 259-1063 john@livingrivers.org

Howdy Henritz President Indian Creek Watershed Association PO Box 711 Union, WV 24983 (304) 716-6760 indiancreekwater@gmail.com

Carole Marner Delaware Solidarity 29 Water Street Franklin, NY 13775 (607) 829-8451 carolemarner@frontier.net J. Stephen Cleghorn, PhD Owner Paradise Gardens and Farm 2771 Paradise Road (814) 932-6761 jstephencleghorn@yahoo.com

Peter Hudiburg Founder Plymouth Friends for Clean Water P.O. Box 61 (607) 334-2986 hudiburg@frontiernet.net

Carol Davis Coordinator Diné C.A.R.E . HCR 63 Box 272 Dilkon, AZ 86047 (928) 679-5045 Carol.davis@dine-care.org

George Billard Co-Founder SCRAM PO Box 192 Eldred, NY 12732 info@nyscram.org

Vernon Haltom Executive Director Coal River Mountain Watch P.O. Box 303 Naoma, WV 25140 <u>Vernon@crmw.net</u>

E. Louis Priem, MD Sustainable Otsego 276 Van Yahres Rd Cooperstown, NY 13326 <u>coopbirc@hughes.net</u> Chad Oba President Friends of Buckingham 571 Woods Rd Buckingham 23921 (434) 806-6332 <u>chado108@me.com</u>

Jen Hilburn Executive Director Altamaha Riverkeeper PO Box 4122 Macon, GA (912) 441-3908 Jen@altamahariverkeeper.org

Patti Wood Executive Director Grassroots Environmental Education 52 Main Street, Port Washington, NY 11050 (914) 422-3141 ellen@grassrootsinfo.org

Steve Ellsworth Board Member Sustainable McDonough 850 Hammerle Rd. Oxford, NY 13830 (607) 647-9321 steve.ellsworth2gmail.com Dr Bob Allen Co-chair Don't Gas the Pinelands Coalition Seaville, NJ <u>allwestc@aol.com</u>

Yvonne Taylor Vice President Gas Free Seneca PO Box 333 Watkins Glen NY 14891 (607) 342-1278 gasfreesenecagirl@gmail.com

Joseph Campbell President Seneca Lake Guardian PO Box 333 Watkins Glen NY 14891 (607) 769-4639 <u>muchado2@gmail.com</u>

Marie McRae spokesperson Dryden Resource Awareness Coalition Dryden NY mmmcrae@juno.com

## Cc: Executive Secretariat, U.S. Department of the Interior